PILED
2021 Feb-25 PM 02:32
U.S. DISTRICT COURT
N.D. OF ALABAMA

## Exhibit A

#### Case 1:21-cv-00307 ACA Document 1-1 Filed 02/25/21 Page 2 of 32

Court Action:



Case

**PREPARED FOR: LAURA MIMS** 

County: **61** Case Number: **CV-2021-900021.00** 

Style: MICHAEL J. KULOVITZ V. ASPEN SPECIALTY INSURANCE MGMT, INC.

**Real Time** 

#### Case Information

County: 61-TALLADEGA - Case Number: CV-2021-900021.00

Judge: CEW:CHAD EDWARD WOODRUFF

Style: MICHAEL J. KULOVITZ V. ASPEN SPECIALTY INSURANCE MGMT, INC.

Filed: 01/19/2021 Case Status: ACTIVE Case Type: OTHER TORT

Trial Type: JURY Track: Appellate Case: 0

No of Plaintiffs: 1 No of Defendants: 1

#### **Damages**

Damage Amt: 0.00 Punitive Damages: 0.00 General Damages: 0.00

No Damages: Compensatory Damages: 0.00

Pay To: Payment Frequency: Cost Paid By:

#### **Court Action**

Court Action Code: Court Action Desc: Court Action Date:

Num of Trial days:0Num of Liens:0Judgment For:Disposition Date of Appeal:Disposition Judge::Disposition Type:Revised Judgement Date:Minstral:Appeal Date:

Date Trial Began but No Verdict (TBNV1): Date Trial Began but No Verdict (TBNV2):

#### Comments

Comment 1: Comment 2:

#### **Appeal Information**

Appeal Date: Appeal Case Number: Appeal Court:

Appeal Status: Orgin Of Appeal:

Appeal To: Appeal To Desc: LowerCourt Appeal Date:

Disposition Date Of Appeal: Disposition Type Of Appeal:

#### **Administrative Information**

Transfer to Admin Doc Date: Transfer Reason: Transfer Desc:

Number of Subponeas: Last Update: 01/19/2021 Updated By: AJA

#### **Parties**

#### Party 1 - Plaintiff INDIVIDUAL - KULOVITZ MICHAEL J.

#### Party Information

Party: C001-Plaintiff Name: KULOVITZ MICHAEL J. Type: I-INDIVIDUAL

Index: D ASPEN SPECIA Alt Name: Hardship: No JID: CEW

Address 1: 609 HILLCREST DRIVE Phone: (256) 000-0000

Ex. A. State Court Doc Pg. 001

Address 2: Document 1-1 Filed 02/25/21 Page 3 of 32

Case 1:21-cv-00307-ACA
TALLADEGA State: AL City: 35160-0000 Country: US State:

DOB: Sex: М SSN: **XXX-XX-X999** Race:

**Court Action** 

Court Action Date: Court Action:

Amount of Judgement: \$0.00 Court Action For: Exemptions: \$0.00 Cost Against Party: \$0.00 Other Cost: Date Satisfied: Arrest Date: Comment:

Warrant Action Date: Warrant Action Status: Status Description:

**Service Information** 

Issued: Issued Type: Reissue: Reissue Type: Return: Return Type: Return: Return Type: Served: Service Type Service On: Served By:

Notice of No Service: Notice of No Answer: Answer: Answer Type:

**Attorneys** 

Number Attorney Code Type of Counsel Name **Phone** Attorney 1 **CAR007** CARPENTER BUFORD CLARK JR WTCOLL@BELLSOUTH.NET (256) 362-0081

Party 2 - Defendant BUSINESS - ASPEN SPECIALTY INSURANCE MGMT, INC.

**Party Information** 

**D001-Defendant B-BUSINESS** Party: Name: ASPEN SPECIALTY INSURANCE MGMT, INC. Type:

Index: C KULOVITZ MIC Alt Name: Hardship: No JID: CEW

(256) 000-0000 C/O GENERAL COUNSEL Phone: Address 1:

Address 2: 175 CAPITOL BLVD.

**ROCKY HILL** City: CT Zip: **06067-0000** Country: US State:

SSN: XXX-XX-X999 DOB: Sex: Race:

**Court Action** 

Court Action Date: Court Action:

Amount of Judgement: \$0.00 Court Action For: Exemptions: \$0.00 Other Cost: \$0.00 Cost Against Party: Date Satisfied: Comment:

Arrest Date:

Warrant Action Date: Warrant Action Status: Status Description:

**Service Information** 

01/19/2021 Issued Type: F-CERTIFIED MAIL BY FIL Reissue: Issued: Reissue Type: Return: Return Type: Return: Return Type: Served: 01/27/2021 Service Type C-CERTIFIED MAIL Service On: Served By:

Answer: Answer Type: Notice of No Service: Notice of No Answer:

2

# Attorneys Case 1:21-cv-00307-ACA Document 1-1 Filed 02/25/21 Page 4 of 32 Number Attorney Code Type of Counsel Name Email Phone Attorney 1 000000 PRO SE

#### Financial

Fee S	heet
-------	------

Fee Status	Admin Fee	Fee Code	Payor	Payee	Amount Due	Amount Paid	Balance	Amount Hold	Garnish Party
ACTIVE	N	CONV	C001	000	\$0.00	\$20.40	\$0.00	\$0.00	0
ACTIVE	N	CV05	C001	000	\$340.00	\$340.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	0
ACTIVE	N	JDMD	C001	000	\$100.00	\$100.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	0
ACTIVE	N	LSF3	C001	000	\$25.00	\$25.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	0
ACTIVE	N	VADM	C001	000	\$45.00	\$45.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	0
				Total:	\$510.00	\$530.40	-\$20.40	\$0.00	

#### Financial History

Transaction Date	Description		Transaction Batch	Receipt Number	Amount	From Party	To Party	Money Type	Admin Fee	Reason	Attorney	Operator
01/21/2021	CREDIT	CONV	2021038	1546280	\$20.40	C001	000		N			ALS
01/21/2021	RECEIPT	CV05	2021038	1546290	\$340.00	C001	000		N			ALS
01/21/2021	RECEIPT	JDMD	2021038	1546300	\$100.00	C001	000		N			ALS
01/21/2021	RECEIPT	LSF3	2021038	1546310	\$25.00	C001	000		N			ALS
01/21/2021	RECEIPT	VADM	2021038	1546320	\$45.00	C001	000		N			ALS

Case A	Action S	Summa	ary	
Date:	Time	Code	Comments	Operator
1/19/2021	1:52 PM	FILE	FILED THIS DATE: 01/19/2021 (AV01)	AJA
1/19/2021	1:52 PM	EORD	E-ORDER FLAG SET TO "Y" (AV01)	AJA
1/19/2021	1:52 PM	ASSJ	ASSIGNED TO JUDGE: CHAD E WOODRUFF (AV01)	AJA
1/19/2021	1:52 PM	SCAN	CASE SCANNED STATUS SET TO: N (AV01)	AJA
1/19/2021	1:52 PM	ORIG	ORIGIN: INITIAL FILING (AV01)	AJA
1/19/2021	1:52 PM	TDMJ	JURY TRIAL REQUESTED (AV01)	AJA
1/19/2021	1:52 PM	STAT	CASE ASSIGNED STATUS OF: ACTIVE (AV01)	AJA
1/19/2021	1:52 PM	C001	C001 PARTY ADDED: KULOVITZ MICHAEL J. (AV02)	AJA
1/19/2021	1:52 PM	C001	INDIGENT FLAG SET TO: N (AV02)	AJA
1/19/2021	1:52 PM	C001	LISTED AS ATTORNEY FOR C001: CARPENTER BUFORD CLA	AJA
1/19/2021	1:52 PM	C001	C001 E-ORDER FLAG SET TO "Y" (AV02)	AJA
1/19/2021	1:52 PM	D001	D001 PARTY ADDED: ASPEN SPECIALTY INSURANCE MGMT,	AJA
1/19/2021	1:52 PM	D001	INDIGENT FLAG SET TO: N (AV02)	AJA
1/19/2021	1:52 PM	D001	LISTED AS ATTORNEY FOR D001: PRO SE (AV02)	AJA
1/19/2021	1:52 PM	D001	D001 E-ORDER FLAG SET TO "Y" (AV02)	AJA
1/19/2021	1:52 PM	D001	CERT MAIL-FIL ISSUED: 01/19/2021 TO D001 (AV02)	AJA
1/19/2021	1:55 PM	ECOMP	COMPLAINT E-FILED.	CAR007
2/1/2021	11:52 AM	EMISC	RETURN ON SERVICE - SERVED E-FILED	CAR007
2/1/2021	12:01 PM	D001	SERVICE OF CERTIFIED MAI ON 01/27/2021 FOR D001	ALS

Images				
Date:	Doc#	Title	Description	Ex. A. State Court Doc Pg. 003
				LA. A. State Court Doc 1 q. 003

1/19/2021 1:55:09 PM	1 Case	CIVIL COVER SHEET 1:21-CV-00307-ACA Docum	CIRCUIT COURT - CIVIL CASE	Page 5 of 32	1
1/19/2021 1:55:09 PM	2	COMPLAINT	ment 1 1 ned 02/25/21	1 age 3 01 32	19
1/19/2021 1:55:52 PM	3	COMPLAINT - TRANSMITTAL	E-NOTICE TRANSMITTALS		2
1/19/2021 1:55:53 PM	4	COMPLAINT - SUMMONS	E-NOTICE TRANSMITTALS		1
2/1/2021 11:52:02 AM	5	RETURN ON SERVICE - SERVED	Return on Service		1
2/1/2021 11:52:08 AM	6	MISCELLANEOUS - TRANSMITTAL	E-NOTICE TRANSMITTALS		3



END OF THE REPORT

DOCUMENT 1

State of Alabama **Unified Judicial System** 

#### **COVER SHEET CIRCUIT COURT - CIVIL CASE**

61-CV-2021-900021.00 Cas CIRCUIT COURT OF TALLADEGA COUNTY, ALABAMA BRIAN YORK, CLERK 61 D

ate of ⊦iling:	Judge Code:
1/19/2021	

Form ARCiv-93	Rev. 9/18	(NOT FOR DO	mestic Relations Cases)	01/19/2021	g. Judge Code.
		GEN	IERAL INFORMATION	ON	
			JRT OF TALLADEGA CO . ASPEN SPECIALTY IN	•	
First Plaintiff:	☐ Business ☐ Government	✓ Individual  ☐ Other	First Defendant:	<ul><li>✓ Business</li><li>☐ Government</li></ul>	☐ Individual ☐ Other
NATURE OF	SUIT: Select prim	ary cause of action	by checking box (check on	ly one) that best char	acterizes your action:
TONG - N TOMV - N TOWA - V TOPL - Pr TOMM - N TOLM - M	Vrongful Death legligence: General legligence: Motor Volumess roduct Liability/AEI Malpractice-Medical lalpractice-Legal Malpractice-Other raud/Bad Faith/Misther:	/ehicle MLD al	Enforcemen  CVRT - Civil Rights  COND - Condemnat  CTMP - Contempt o  CONT - Contract/Eje  TOCN - Conversion  EQND - Equity Non-Injunction E	Certificate Modification of Agency Subpoent it of Agency Subpoent	re claratory Judgment/ Title/Sale For Division
TORE - R  OTHER CIVIL I  ABAN - AI  ACCT - AG  APAA - AG  ADPA - AG	ersonal Property eal Properly  FILINGS bandoned Automo ccount & Nonmorte dministrative Agen dministrative Proceuties in Need of Pr	gage cy Appeal edure Act	☐ PFAB - Protection F☐ EPFA - Elder Protection F☐ FELA - Railroad/Sea☐ RPRO - Real Prope	rom Abuse tion From Abuse aman (FELA) rty state/Guardianship/C ompensation	rit/Mandamus/Prohibition
ORIGIN: F	✓ INITIAL FILING	G	A APPEAL FROM DISTRICT COUP  T TRANSFERRED OTHER CIRCUIT	FROM	O   OTHER
HAS JURY TRI	IAL BEEN DEMAI	NDED? ✓YES	I INO	ng "Yes" does not consti	
RELIEF REQU	ESTED:	<b>✓</b> MONETARY	AWARD REQUESTED		VARD REQUESTED
CAR00		1/19. Date	/2021 1:55:28 PM		CLARK CARPENTER Attorney/Party filing this form
MEDIATION RI	EQUESTED:	☐ YES [	NO UNDECIDED		
Election to Proceed under the Alabama Rules for Expedited Civil Actions: ☐ YES ✓ NO					

#### IN THE CIRCUIT COURT OF TALLADEGA COUNTY, ALABAMA

MICHAEL J. KULOVITZ,	)	
Plaintiff,	)	
<i>y</i> .	)	CASE NO.: CV-
Aspen Specialty Insurance Company,	)	
and ABC; ABC being those persons, firms, corporations, or entities issuing to Michael J.	,	
Kulovitz that certain professional liability	)	
insurance policy made the subject of the complaint in this case, being policy number	)	
ES10274-01, whose names are otherwise	)	
unknown, but whose name will be added by	)	
amendment when ascertained,	) )	
Defendants.	)	

#### **COMPLAINT**

#### COUNT 1: BREACH OF CONTRACT

1.) At a point prior to August 19, 2019, Aspen Specialty Insurance Company (hereinafter "Aspen") and ABC issued a policy of professional liability insurance bearing policy number ES10274-01 to Michael J. Kulovitz, in which Aspen and ABC agreed to defend and indemnify Michael J. Kulovitz regarding any sums he became legally obligated to pay as damages in circumstances as alleged (but untrue) by the plaintiff in the original and amended complaints of Angela Barclay Hunter (hereinafter "Hunter") in Civil Action Number CV-2019-900480, presently pending in the Circuit Court of Talladega County, Alabama, copies of which are attached hereto as Exhibit A as if fully and completely set out herein.

- 2.) On or about October 17, 2019, and October 23, 2019, Michael J. Kulovitz notified Aspen and ABC in writing of Hunter's claim and requested Aspen and ABC to provide a defense and indemnity to him for that claim.
- 3.) On or about November 12, 2019, Aspen and ABC refused to defend or indemnify Michael J. Kulovitz and advised that Aspen and ABC would not be taking any action in connection with the Hunter lawsuit by and through the agent of Aspen and ABC, Ronald L. Kamer. Subsequent correspondence on behalf of Michael J. Kulovitz seeking reconsideration by Aspen and ABC of the decision resulted only in a final notice from their agent, Mr. Kammer, that the original denial of coverage would stand by email of November 5, 2020.
- 4.) The refusal by Aspen and ABC to indemnify and defend Michael J. Kulovitz in the action by Hunter is a breach of the insurance contract referenced here

#### **COUNT 2: BAD FAITH**

- 5.) The plaintiff, Michael J Kulovitz, re-alleges the matters contained in paragraphs 1 through 4.
- 6.) The refusal of Aspen and ABC to indemnify and defend Michael J. Kulovitz with regard to the Hunter litigation was without a legitimate or arguable basis, and as such, Aspen and ABC are guilty of "normal" bad faith.
- 7.) In addition or in the alternative, Aspen and ABC's refusal to indemnify and defend Michael J. Kulovitz was accompanied by an intentional or reckless failure to properly subject the claim to a cognitive evaluation or review, with a manufactured debatable reason to deny the claim and/or based upon reliance on an ambiguous portion of the policy. As such, Aspen and ABC are guilty of "abnormal" bad faith.

#### PROXIMATE CAUSE & DAMAGES

As a proximate result of the breach of contract and bad faith of Aspen and ABC, Plaintiff Michael J. Kulovitz, has and will suffer financial loss in the form of attorney's fees, claim expenses, loss of time, and other economic losses, as well as the amount of any judgment rendered in the unlikely event of a judgment in favor of Hunter in the underlying action, as well as mental and emotional distress.

WHEREFORE, subject to his deductible, Michael J. Kulovitz claims of Aspen and ABC indemnification for any judgment rendered against him in favor of Hunter with regard to the claims of Hunter, and compensatory damages for attorney's fees for the defense of the underlying action, claims expenses, loss of time, other economic and financial losses, and for his mental and emotional distress occasioned by Aspen's and ABC's refusal to indemnify and defend.

THIS PLAINTIFF DEMANDS A TRIAL BY STRUCK JURY ON ALL ISSUES PRESENTED IN THIS CAUSE.

Respectfully Submitted,

/s/ B. Clark Carpenter, Jr.
B. CLARK CARPENTER, JR. (CAR007)
Attorney for Plaintiff Michael J. Kulovitz

OF COUNSEL: THORNTON, CARPENTER, O'BRIEN, LAWRENCE & SIMS Post Office Drawer 277 Talladega, Alabama 35161 (256) 362-0081

#### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

The Clerk of this Court is requested to serve Defendant Aspen Specialty Insurance Management Inc. by certified mail at:

Aspen Specialty Insurance Management Inc. c/o General Counsel 175 Capitol Blvd. Rocky Hill, CT 06067

/s/ B. Clark Carpenter, Jr.
OF COUNSEL

21 Page 11 of 32

ELECTRONICALLY FILED

6/18/2020 3:44 PM

61-CV-2019-900480.00

CIRCUIT COURT OF

TALLADEGA COUNTY, ALABAMA

BRIAN YORK, CLERK

#### IN THE CIRCUIT COURT FOR TALLADEGA COUNTY, ALABAMA

ANGELA BARCLAY HUNTER,	§
Plaintiffs,	<b>§</b> §
VS.	§ CASE NO. : CV-2019-900480.00
MICHAEL J. KULOVITZ,	§
Defendant.	§ * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * *

#### FIRST AMENDED COMPLAINT

Comes now the Plaintiff and amends her complaint to provide specificity to her fraud count and restate her remaining claims as follows:

- 1. Plaintiff, Angela Barclay Hunter is a resident of Talladega County, Alabama.
- 2. Defendant Michael J. Kulovitz is a resident of Talladega County, Alabama and operated a dental office at 108 North Street East, Talladega, Alabama, 35161.
- 3. On about April and May, 2016, Plaintiff underwent extensive dental work at Defendant's office. By October 13, 2016, Plaintiff owed Defendant \$1,699.00.
- 4. At that time, Defendant agreed to accept payments on the balance due but wanted a check from Plaintiff for the full amount to be held as some kind of security. Plaintiff's husband, Trenton Hunter authorized Plaintiff to issue a check in the amount of \$1,699.00 to be held by Defendant while payments were made. Plaintiff's check was dated 10-13-16.
- 5. Thereafter, Plaintiff made payments and her insurance made payments and by August 2017, the balance due was \$598.55.
- 6. With insurance payments being made, Plaintiff waited on updated statements from Defendant and Defendant did not send any balance due bills after March 2018.
- 7. On about October 19, 2018, the Defendant, knowing that the amount due was \$598.55 and that even that amount was not certain, attempted to cash the old check (\$1,699.00). Because the check was two years old, the bank would not accept it. So, Defendant altered the date on the check to reflect the year 2018. Thus, the new forged date on the check was 10-13-18.
- 8. The two year old check was returned for insufficient funds. Thereafter, Defendant filed charges against Plaintiff for "Negotiating a Worthless Instrument" in Talladega County District Court. These were false charges based on a altered instrument forged by Defendant and claiming an amount greater than the amount owed. Defendant's actions were contumely and malicious.

Exhibit

by

Exhibit

Doc Pg. 010

- 9. On about May 4, 2019, Plaintiff was stopped while driving. Plaintiff was informed by the Talladega Sheriff Deputy that there was a warrant for her arrest. Plaintiff was arrested; her car was towed to an impound lot, Plaintiff was booked and incarcerated. Plaintiff was required to post an appearance bond; and her case was set for trial in June 2019. Plaintiff hired a lawyer to defend her.
- 10. Plaintiff and her attorney attended a trial setting on said charge and explained to the District Attorney that the check was two years old and altered; that the balance due was far less than the amount of the check; and the check was never intended to be used to pay for a balance that was ever decreasing.
- 11. On about July 3, 2019, the charges against Plaintiff were dismissed.

#### **COUNT ONE**

- 12. Plaintiff adopts and incorporates by reference all allegations set forth above.
- 13. Defendant is guilty of malicious prosecution and abuse of process. As a proximate cause of Defendant's wrongful acts, Plaintiff Angela Barclay Hunter has suffered emotional distress, embarrassment, inconvenience, incarceration, loss of time, and financial damages.

#### **COUNT TWO**

- 14. Plaintiff adopts and incorporates by reference all allegations set forth above.
- 15. Defendants are guilty of negligence and wantonness. As a proximate cause of Defendant's wrongful acts, Plaintiff Angela Barclay Hunter has suffered emotional distress, embarrassment, inconvenience, incarceration, loss of time, and financial damages.

#### **COUNT THREE**

- 16. Plaintiff adopts and incorporates by reference all allegations set forth above.
- Defendant is guilty of fraud. Between 2016 and October 2018, Plaintiff had paid Defendant substantial amounts of money directly and through dental insurance. In mid-2018, Plaintiff was not sure of the balance due and Defendant had not sent a statement in months. The actual balance due was less than \$700. On about October 19, 2018, Defendant altered Plaintiff's two year old check in the amount of \$1,699.00 so that it appeared to have been written on 10-13-18. Defendant then placed this check into its bank (First Bank of Alabama) for deposit, thereby representing to Plaintiff's bank, America's First Federal Credit Union (agent) that 1.) this check was written by Plaintiff less that a week prior, and 2.) Plaintiff owed Defendant this amount less than a week prior. After the check was returned for insufficient funds, Defendant misrepresented to the Talladega Sheriff's Department (a governmental entity for the citizens of Talladega County, including Plaintiff) that this check was recently presented by Plaintiffs for a current debt. These representations made by Defendant to Plaintiff's bank and county law enforcement were false and Defendant knew they were false. As a proximate cause of Defendant's wrongful acts.

Plaintiff Angela Barclay Hunter was arrested and incarcerated as stated above and has suffered emotional distress, embarrassment, inconvenience, incarceration, loss of time, and financial damages.

#### **COUNT FOUR**

- 18. Plaintiff adopts and incorporates by reference all allegations set forth above.
- 19. Defendant is guilty of deceptive trade practices. As a proximate cause of Defendant's wrongful acts, Plaintiff Angela Barclay Hunter has suffered emotional distress, embarrassment, inconvenience, incarceration, loss of time, and financial damages.

WHEREFORE, Plaintiff demands judgement against Defendants in the amount to be determined by a jury for compensatory and punitive damages, attorney fees and court costs.

### /s/ KearneyDeeHutsler

KEARNEY DEE HUTSLER Attorney for Plaintiff 15 Richard Arrington Blvd. N., #320 Birmingham Alabama 35223 (205) 414-9979 Fax (205) 879-9229

#### PLAINTIFF DEMANDS TRIAL BY JURY.

/s/ Kearne	y Dee Hutsler

#### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that on the <u>18th</u> day of June, 2020, I have forwarded a true and correct copy of the foregoing via  $\blacksquare$  electronic delivery, or first-class mail or  $\square$  overnight delivery, to the following:

Clark Carpenter, Esq. P.O. Box 277 Talladega, AL 35161-0277

/s/ Kearney Dee Hutsler

ELECTRONICALLY FILED
9/16/2019 2:35 PM
61-CV-2019-900480.00
CIRCUIT COURT OF
TALLADEGA COUNTY, ALABAMA
BRIAN YORK, CLERK

#### IN THE CIRCUIT COURT FOR TALLADEGA COUNTY, ALABAMA

ANGELA BARCLAY HUNTER,	§ 8
Plaintiffs,	\$ 
vs.	§ CASE NO.:
MICHAEL J. KULOVITZ,	Š
Defendant.	§ §
etermination et a communication de la communic	COMPLAINT

Comes now the Plaintiff and states that:

- 1. Plaintiff, Angela Barclay Hunter is a resident of Talladega County, Alabama.
- 2. Defendant Michael J. Kulovitz is a resident of Talladega County, Alabama and operated a dental office at 108 North Street East, Talladega, Alabama, 35161.
- 3. On about April and May, 2016, Plaintiff underwent extensive dental work at Defendant's office. By October 13, 2016, Plaintiff owed Defendant \$1,699.00.
- 4. At that time, Defendant agreed to accept payments on the balance due but wanted a check from Plaintiff for the full amount to be held as some kind of security. Plaintiff's husband, Trenton Hunter authorized Plaintiff to issue a check in the amount of \$1,699.00 to be held by Defendant while payments were made. Plaintiff's check was dated 10-13-16.
- 5. Thereafter, Plaintiff made payments and her insurance made payments and by August 2017, the balance due was \$598.55.
- 6. With insurance payments being made, Plaintiff waited on updated statements from Defendant and Defendant did not send any balance due bills after March 2018.
- 7. On about October 19, 2018, the Defendant, knowing that the amount due was \$598.55 and that even that amount was not certain, attempted to cash the old check (\$1,699.00). Because the check was two years old, the bank would not accept it. So, Defendant altered the date on the check to reflect the year 2018. Thus, the new forged date on the check was 10-13-18.
- 8. The two year old check was returned for insufficient funds. Thereafter, Defendant filed charges against Plaintiff for "Negotiating a Worthless Instrument" in Talladega County District Court. These were false charges based on a altered instrument forged by Defendant and claiming an amount greater than the amount owed. Defendant's actions were contumely and malicious.

Ex. A. State Court Doc Pg. 013

- 9. On about May 4, 2019, Plaintiff was stopped while driving. Plaintiff was informed by the Talladega Sheriff Deputy that there was a warrant for her arrest. Plaintiff was arrested; her car was towed to an impound lot, Plaintiff was booked and incarcerated. Plaintiff was required to post an appearance bond; and her case was set for trial in June 2019. Plaintiff hired a lawyer to defend her.
- 10. Plaintiff and her attorney attended a trial setting on said charge and explained to the District Attorney that the check was two years old and altered; that the balance due was far less than the amount of the check; and the check was never intended to be used to pay for a balance that was ever decreasing.
- 11. On about July 3, 2019, the charges against Plaintiff were dismissed.

#### **COUNT ONE**

- 12. Plaintiff adopts and incorporates by reference all allegations set forth above.
- 13. Defendant is guilty of malicious prosecution and abuse of process. As a proximate cause of Defendant's wrongful acts, Plaintiff Angela Barclay Hunter has suffered emotional distress, embarrassment, inconvenience, incarceration, loss of time, and financial damages.

#### **COUNT TWO**

- 14. Plaintiff adopts and incorporates by reference all allegations set forth above.
- 15. Defendants are guilty of negligence and wantonness. As a proximate cause of Defendant's wrongful acts, Plaintiff Angela Barclay Hunter has suffered emotional distress, embarrassment, inconvenience, incarceration, loss of time, and financial damages.

#### **COUNT THREE**

- 16. Plaintiff adopts and incorporates by reference all allegations set forth above.
- 17. Defendant is guilty of fraud. Defendant altered Plaintiff's document to misrepresent the nature of the facts to the bank and law enforcement thereby causing harm to Plaintiff. As a proximate cause of Defendant's wrongful acts, Plaintiff Angela Barclay Hunter has suffered emotional distress, embarrassment, inconvenience, incarceration, loss of time, and financial damages.

#### **COUNT FOUR**

- 18. Plaintiff adopts and incorporates by reference all allegations set forth above.
- 19. Defendant is guilty of deceptive trade practices. As a proximate cause of Defendant's wrongful acts, Plaintiff Angela Barclay Hunter has suffered emotional distress, embarrassment, inconvenience, incarceration, loss of time, and financial damages.

WHEREFORE, Plaintiff demands judgement against Defendants in the amount to be determined by a jury for compensatory and punitive damages, attorney fees and court costs.

## /s/ KearneyDeeHutsler

KEARNEY DEE HUTSLER
Attorney for Plaintiff
15 Richard Arrington Blvd. N., #320
Birmingham Alabama 35223
(205) 414-9979 Fax (205) 879-9229

PLAINTIFF DEMANDS TRIAL BY JURY.

/s/ Kearney Dee Hutsle	r
------------------------	---

Please serve the Defendant at the following address:

Michael J. Kulovitz 108 North Street East Talladega, AL 35161

#### IN THE CIRCUIT COURT FOR TALLADEGA COUNTY, ALABAMA

ANGELA BARCLAY HUNTER,	§
	§
Plaintiffs,	§
VS.	§ CASE NO.:
MICHAEL J. KULOVITZ,	§
en e	§
Defendant.	<b>§</b>

#### PLAINTIFF'S INTERROGATORIES AND REQUEST FOR PRODUCTION

Comes now the Plaintiff and propounds the following interrogatories and request for production to Defendant Michael J. Kulovitz:

- 1. Please produce a copy of you malpractice insurance policy.
- 2. Please produce a copy of any other insurance covering your negligent acts.
- 3. Please state the full names, office title and address of each person having anything to do with the altered check and charges brought against Plaintiff. Please state in detail what each person did. Also explain what the bank (which one?) said about a 2 year old check.
- 4. Have you been paid in full for all dental work done for Plaintiff? If not, how much is owed?
- 5. Please produce any photographs or video of the Plaintiffs.
- 6. Describe the purpose for requiring Plaintiff to write a check for \$1,699.00 on October 13, 2016.

/s/ Kearney Dee Hutsler
KEARNEY DEE HUTSLER
Attorney for Plaintiff
15 Richard Arrington Blvd. N., Ste. 320
Birmingham Alabama 35203
(205) 414-9979
879-9229 fax

Please serve the Defendant with this discovery at the following address: Michael J. Kulovitz
108 North Street East
Talladega, AL 35161

#### IN THE CIRCUIT COURT OF TALLADEGA COUNTY, ALABAMA

MICHAEL J. KULOVITZ,	)
Plaintiff,	) )
vs.	) CASE NO.: CV-
Aspen Specialty Insurance Company, and ABC; ABC being those persons, firms,	/
corporations, or entities issuing to Michael J. Kulovitz that certain professional liability insurance policy made the subject of the	) )
case being policy number ES10274-01, whose names are otherwise unknown, but	) ) )
whose name will be added by amendment when ascertained,	) )
Defendant.	) )

## PLAINTIFF'S FIRST INTERROGATORIES TO DEFENDANT ASPEN SPECIALTY INSURANCE COMPANY

COMES NOW Plaintiff Michael Kulovitz and desiring the testimony of Defendant Aspen Specialty Insurance Company (hereinafter "Aspen"), propounds the following interrogatories:

- 1. Please state the correct legal name of the entity that issued Policy ES10274-01 to Michael J. Kulovitz, with a policy period from August 19, 2019 to August 19, 2020.
- 2. Please state the correct legal name of each agent, servant, employee, or representative of Aspen involved in making the decision to deny a defense and/or indemnity to Michael J. Kulovitz, with regard to the action of Angela Hunter referenced in the Complaint in this matter.
- 3. Please state the correct legal name of each agent, servant, employee, or representative of Aspen that authored the letter of Ronald Kammer to B. Clark Carpenter, Jr., dated July 9, 2020, in response to a letter from B. Clark Carpenter, Jr. of June 12, 2020.

- 4. Please state the correct legal name of each agent, servant, employee, or representative of Aspen that authored the letter of Ronald Kammer to B. Clark Carpenter, Jr., dated November 12, 2019, in response to a letter from B. Clark Carpenter, Jr., of October 17, 2019.
- 5. Please state the correct legal name of each person who authored all policy forms, endorsements, and other pages comprising Policy ES10274-01, setting out the identity of each person that authored each particular policy form, endorsement, or other pages making up the policy.

Respectfully Submitted,

/s B. Clark Carpenter, Jr.

B. Clark Carpenter, Jr. (CAR007) Attorney for Plaintiff Michael J. Kulovitz P.O. Box 277 Talladega, AL 35161 (256) 362-0081 wtcoll@bellsouth.net

#### IN THE CIRCUIT COURT OF TALLADEGA COUNTY, ALABAMA

MICHAEL J. KULOVII Z,	)
Plaintiff,	) )
vs.	) CASE NO.: CV-
Aspen Specialty Insurance Company, and ABC; ABC being those persons, firms,	<i>)</i> ) )
corporations, or entities issuing to Michael J.	,
Kulovitz that certain professional liability	)
insurance policy made the subject of this	)
case being policy number ES10274-01,	)
whose names are otherwise unknown, but	)
whose name will be added by amendment	)
when ascertained,	)
	)
Defendant.	)

## PLAINTIFF'S FIRST REQUESTS FOR PRODUCTION TO DEFENDANT ASPEN SPECIALTY INSURANCE COMPANY

Plaintiff Michael J. Kulovitz requests that Defendant Aspen Speciality Insurance Company (hereinafter "Aspen") respond to the below requests within 45 days of the date it is served with the Complaint, and that it produce and permit the plaintiff to inspect and copy the following documents:

Aspen's entire claim and coverage files generated in connection with the claim of Angela
 Hunter against Michael Kulovitz in the Circuit Court of Talladega County, Alabama, CV 2019-900480, including, but not limited to, any documents generated prior to suit being
 filed and including, but not limited to, any documents kept electronically.

- 2. Any material, whether electronically stored or generated or existing on hard copy, of any nature, form, or description with any connection to the claim of Angela Hunter against Michael Kulovitz in the Circuit Court of Talladega County, Alabama, Civil Action No. 2019-900480, whether generated before or after suit was filed.
- 3. A complete certified copy of Policy ES10274-01 containing all policy forms, endorsements, and other pages making up the entire policy.
- 4. A copy of the letter of Ronald Kammer to B. Clark Carpenter, Jr., dated July 9, 2020, in response to a letter from B. Clark Carpenter, Jr., of June 12, 2020.
- 5. A copy of the letter of Ronald Kammer to B. Clark Carpenter, Jr., dated November 12, 2019, in response to a letter from B. Clark Carpenter, Jr., of October 17, 2019.

Respectfully Submitted,

/s B. Clark Carpenter, Jr.

B. Clark Carpenter, Jr. (CAR007) Attorney for Plaintiff Michael J. Kulovitz P.O. Box 277 Talladega, AL 35161 (256) 362-0081 wtcoll@bellsouth.net

#### IN THE CIRCUIT COURT OF TALLADEGA COUNTY, ALABAMA

MICHAEL J. KULOVIIZ,	)	
Plaintiff,	)	
vs.	)	CASE NO.: CV-
Aspen Specialty Insurance Company,	)	
and ABC; ABC being those persons, firms,	, )	
corporations, or entities issuing to Michael .	J.)	
Kulovitz that certain professional liability	)	
insurance policy made the subject of this	)	
case being policy number ES10274-01,	)	
are otherwise unknown, but whose name	)	
will be added by amendment when	)	
ascertained,	)	
	)	
Defendant.	)	

## REQUESTS FOR ADMISSION TO DEFENDANT ASPEN SPECIALITY INSURANCE COMPANY

COMES NOW Plaintiff Michael J. Kulovitz, and desiring the testimony of Defendant Aspen Specialty Insurance Company (hereinafter "Aspen"), propounds to that defendant the following requests for admissions:

- Please admit that the original complaint of Angela Hunter referenced in the complaint in this
  case was filed between August 19, 2019 and August 19, 2020.
- Please admit that the original complaint of Angela Hunter referenced in the complaint in this
  case was first received by Michael J. Kulovitz between August 19, 2019 and August 19,
  2020.

- 3. Please admit that the original complaint of Angela Hunter against Michael J. Kulovitz was received by Aspen between August 19, 2019 and August 19, 2020.
- 4. Please admit that Michael J. Kulovitz, acting personally or through his representative, presented a demand to Aspen to provide a defense and indemnity to him with regard to the original complaint of Angela Hunter against Michael J. Kulovitz between August 19, 2019 and August 19, 2020, as referenced in the complaint in this action.
- 5. Please admit that Aspen received a demand from Michael J. Kulovitz, acting personally or through his representative, for Aspen to indemnify and defend him with regard to the original complaint of Angela Hunter against Michael J. Kulovitz between August 19, 2019 and August 19, 2020, as referenced in the complaint in this action.
- 6. Please admit that Aspen has denied the demand of Michael J. Kulovitz to provide a defense and indemnity to him regarding the action filed by Angela Hunter against him referenced in the complaint in this matter.
- 7. Please admit that the alleged injuries resulting from Michael J. Kulovitz's alleged malicious prosecution of Angela Hunter in Count One of her original and amended complaints against Michael J. Kulovitz were emotional distress, embarrassment, inconvenience, incarceration, loss of time, and financial damages.
- 8. Please admit that Policy ES10274-01 contains the following language: "We will pay all amounts up to the limit of liability which you become legally obligated to pay as a result of injury or damage."
- 9. Please admit that Policy ES10274-01 contains the following language: "**Injury**" as defined in the General Conditions shall also include the following:

A. "Malicious prosecution"

- 10. Please admit that in Alabama, the elements of malicious prosecution are: (1) the institution of judicial proceedings; (2) without probable cause; (3) with malice; (4) disposition favorable to the plaintiff; and (5) injury.
- 11. Please admit that Count One of the original and amended complaints of Angela Hunter against Michael J. Kulovitz in this action referenced in the complaint allege that Michael J. Kulovitz instituted a judicial proceeding against Angela Hunter.
- 12. Please admit that under the law in Alabama, "absent evidence to the contrary, 'the words of agreement will be given their ordinary meaning." See *Flowers v. Flowers*, 334 So. 2d 856 (Ala. 1976).
- Please admit that under the law in Alabama, the phrase "arising out of" is to be construed very broadly as a general and comprehensive term and is ordinarily understood to mean "originating from," "having its origin in," "growing out of," or "flowing from."
- 14. Please admit that in the original claim of Angela Hunter against Michael J. Kulovitz attached to the complaint herein, there is no claim for any fines, penalties, sanctions, government payments, or the return or withdrawal of fees for patient treatment.
- 15. Please admit that in the original and amended complaints of Angela Hunter attached to the complaint in this action, it is alleged that Angela Hunter underwent extensive dental work for which she owed \$1699, and the check was delivered "to be held in some kind of security" for the dental work.
- 16. Please admit that the "dental work" referenced in the original and amended complaints of Angela Hunter against Michael J. Kulovitz constituted professional services within the meaning of the policy of insurance issued by Aspen (Policy ES10274-01).
- 17. Please admit that the institution of judicial proceedings referenced in the malicious

prosecution in Count One of the complaint of Angela Hunter against Michael J. Kulovitz originated from, had its origin in, grew out of, or flowed from the dental work performed by Michael J. Kulovitz for which Angela Hunter owed, and for which Angela Hunter provided the check made the subject of the arrest warrant as security for payment.

- 18. Please admit that under Alabama law, insurance policies are to be construed in favor of the insured and strictly against the insurer. See *Safeco Ins. Co. v. Banks*, 152 So. 2d 666 (Ala. 1963).
- 19. Please admit that under Alabama law, ambiguities in insurance policies are resolved in favor of the insured . See *Safeco Ins. Co. v. Banks, supra*.

Respectfully Submitted,

/s B. Clark Carpenter, Jr.

B. Clark Carpenter, Jr. (CAR007)
Attorney for Plaintiff Michael J. Kulovitz
P.O. Box 277
Talladega, AL 35161
(256) 362-0081
wtcoll@bellsouth.net



#### AlaFile E-Notice

61-CV-2021-900021.00

To: B CLARK CARPENTER WTCOLL@bellsouth.net

#### NOTICE OF ELECTRONIC FILING

IN THE CIRCUIT COURT OF TALLADEGA COUNTY, ALABAMA

MICHAEL J. KULOVITZ V. ASPEN SPECIALTY INSURANCE MGMT, INC. 61-CV-2021-900021.00

The following complaint was FILED on 1/19/2021 1:55:09 PM

Notice Date: 1/19/2021 1:55:09 PM

BRIAN YORK CIRCUIT COURT CLERK TALLADEGA COUNTY, ALABAMA P O BOX 6137 TALLADEGA, AL, 35161

ase 1:21-cv-00307-ACA Document 1-1 Filed 02/25/21 Page 27 of 32



#### AlaFile E-Notice

61-CV-2021-900021.00

To: ASPEN SPECIALTY INSURANCE MGMT, INC. C/O GENERAL COUNSEL 175 CAPITOL BLVD. ROCKY HILL, CT, 06067

#### NOTICE OF ELECTRONIC FILING

IN THE CIRCUIT COURT OF TALLADEGA COUNTY, ALABAMA

MICHAEL J. KULOVITZ V. ASPEN SPECIALTY INSURANCE MGMT, INC. 61-CV-2021-900021.00

The following complaint was FILED on 1/19/2021 1:55:09 PM

Notice Date: 1/19/2021 1:55:09 PM

BRIAN YORK CIRCUIT COURT CLERK TALLADEGA COUNTY, ALABAMA P O BOX 6137 TALLADEGA, AL, 35161

State of Alabama
Unified Judicial System
Form C-34 Pay 4/2017

#### SUMMONS - CIVIL -

**Court Case Number** 61-CV-2021-900021.00

Form C-34 Rev. 4/2017	- CI	VIL -	01 01 2021 000021.00
IN	THE CIRCUIT COURT (	OF TALLADEGA COUNT	Y. ALABAMA
		PEN SPECIALTY INSURA	•
NOTICE TO: ASPEN SPECIAL	TY INSURANCE MGMT, INC., C/O	GENERAL COUNSEL 175 CAPITOL	BLVD., ROCKY HILL, CT 06067
		Name and Address of Defendar	nt)
THE COMPLAINT OR OTHER DOCUMENT WHICH IS ATTACHED TO THIS SUMMONS IS IMPORTANT, AND YOU MUST TAKE IMMEDIATE ACTION TO PROTECT YOUR RIGHTS. YOU OR YOUR ATTORNEY ARE REQUIRED TO FILE THE ORIGINAL OF YOUR WRITTEN ANSWER, EITHER ADMITTING OR DENYING EACH ALLEGATION IN THE COMPLAINT OR OTHER DOCUMENT, WITH THE CLERK OF THIS COURT. A COPY OF YOUR ANSWER MUST BE MAILED OR HAND DELIVERED BY YOU OR YOUR ATTORNEY TO THE PLAINTIFF(S) OR ATTORNEY(S) OF THE PLAINTIFF(S), B CLARK CARPENTER			
	[Nam	ne(s) of Attorney(s)]	
WHOSE ADDRESS(ES) IS/AI	RE: <u>212 NORTH STREET V</u>		
		[Address(es) of Plaintiff(s	· · · · · ·
	SERVED ON YOU OR A J	UDGMENT BY DEFAULT M	THIS SUMMONS AND COMPLAINT OR MAY BE RENDERED AGAINST YOU FOR OCUMENT.
TO ANY SHER		UTHORIZED BY THE ALE TO SERVE PROCESS:	ABAMA RULES OF CIVIL
☐ You are hereby commar	nded to serve this Summ	ons and a copy of the Cor	mplaint or other document in
this action upon the abo		• • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • •	
✓ Service by certified mail	of this Summons is initia	ted upon the written reque	est of MICHAEL J. KULOVITZ
pursuant to the Alabama	a Rules of the Civil Proce	dure.	[Name(s)]
01/19/2021		/s/ BRIAN YORK	Ву:
(Date)		(Signature of Clerk)	(Name)
✓ Certified Mail is hereby i		/s/ B CLARK CARPENT	 FR
Contined Wall to Hereby 1	equesteu.	(Plaintiff's/Attorney's Signature	
	RETUI	RN ON SERVICE	
☐ Return receipt of certifie	d mail received in this off		
return receipt or certific	a man received in this on		 (Date)
☐ I certify that I personally	delivered a copy of this	Summons and Complaint	• •
	• • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • •	in .	County.
(Name of Pe	rson Served)		ame of County)
Alabama on	,	,	,
/ llabalila on	(Date)		
	,		(Address of Server)
(Type of Process Server)	(Server's Signa	ature)	,
(Type of Troccos derver)	(Server & Signe	itaro)	
	(Server's Printe	ed Name)	(Phone Number of Server)
	(00/70/07/////	a rumo,	(i none number of server)

Complete items 1, 2, and 3.  Print your name and address on the reverse so that we can return the card to you.  Attach this card to the back of the mailpiece, or on the front if space permits.  Article Addressed to: Aspen Specialty Insurance Mgmt Inc.  c/o General Counsel 175 Capitol Blvd. Rocky Hill, CT 06067	A. Signature  X. Agent Addressee  B. Received by (Printed Name)  C. Date of Delivery  D. Is delivery address different from item 1? Yes If YES, enter delivery address below: No
9590 9402 5934 0049 1954 85	3. Service Type  Adult Signature  Adult Signature Restricted Delivery  Certified Mail®  Certified Mail Restricted Delivery  Collect on Delivery  Collect on Delivery  Collect on Delivery  Collect on Delivery  Return Receipt for Merchandise
7019 2970 0000 * ''	☐ Signature Confirmation Restricted Delivery
	Domestic Return Receipt



#### AlaFile E-Notice

61-CV-2021-900021.00

To: B CLARK CARPENTER WTCOLL@bellsouth.net

#### NOTICE OF ELECTRONIC FILING

IN THE CIRCUIT COURT OF TALLADEGA COUNTY, ALABAMA

MICHAEL J. KULOVITZ V. ASPEN SPECIALTY INSURANCE MGMT, INC. 61-CV-2021-900021.00

The following RETURN ON SERVICE - SERVED was FILED on 2/1/2021 11:52:02 AM

Notice Date: 2/1/2021 11:52:02 AM

BRIAN YORK CIRCUIT COURT CLERK TALLADEGA COUNTY, ALABAMA P O BOX 6137 TALLADEGA, AL, 35161

se 1:21-cv-00307-ACA Document 1-1 Filed 02/25/21 Page 31 of 32



#### AlaFile E-Notice

61-CV-2021-900021.00

To: ASPEN SPECIALTY INSURANCE MGMT, INC. (PRO SE)
C/O GENERAL COUNSEL
175 CAPITOL BLVD.
ROCKY HILL, CT, 06067-0000

#### NOTICE OF ELECTRONIC FILING

IN THE CIRCUIT COURT OF TALLADEGA COUNTY, ALABAMA

MICHAEL J. KULOVITZ V. ASPEN SPECIALTY INSURANCE MGMT, INC. 61-CV-2021-900021.00

The following RETURN ON SERVICE - SERVED was FILED on 2/1/2021 11:52:02 AM

Notice Date: 2/1/2021 11:52:02 AM

BRIAN YORK CIRCUIT COURT CLERK TALLADEGA COUNTY, ALABAMA P O BOX 6137 TALLADEGA, AL, 35161



#### AlaFile E-Notice

61-CV-2021-900021.00

To: B CLARK CARPENTER WTCOLL@bellsouth.net

#### NOTICE OF ELECTRONIC FILING

IN THE CIRCUIT COURT OF TALLADEGA COUNTY, ALABAMA

MICHAEL J. KULOVITZ V. ASPEN SPECIALTY INSURANCE MGMT, INC. 61-CV-2021-900021.00

The following RETURN ON SERVICE - SERVED was FILED on 2/1/2021 11:52:02 AM

Notice Date: 2/1/2021 11:52:02 AM

BRIAN YORK CIRCUIT COURT CLERK TALLADEGA COUNTY, ALABAMA P O BOX 6137 TALLADEGA, AL, 35161